# TOO MANY DEATHS, TOO MANY LEFT BEHIND:

A PEOPLE'S EXTERNAL REVIEW OF THE CDC



# **FACT SHEET**

The US population has suffered worse health consequences due to COVID-19 than comparable wealthy nations.¹ However, when U.S. COVID deaths surpassed 1.1 million in January 2023, with over 500 daily COVID deaths,².³ rather than pausing to acknowledge the grave loss, President Biden moved to end the COVID-19 State of Emergency. Ending the state of emergency without a plan to make its public health measures permanent, will worsen the inequities, which have marked the COVID-19 pandemic in the United States.⁴ We join the World Health Organization, the AFL-CIO and growing voices to say the COVID-19 pandemic isn't over, and the CDC and Biden administration's response has left too many people behind. The public deserves accurate information and guidance from their government, based on the latest science, and that is the CDC's job. Everyone deserves their best chance to be healthy. That includes the right to make sure their basic needs are met without risking severe illness or death from COVID-19.

### Who are we?

The People's CDC, a volunteer-run coalition of public health practitioners, healthcare providers, educators, and people from all walks of life PLUS nearly 500 health workers, community leaders and public health researchers and practitioners who participated in a survey to evaluate the CDC's pandemic management.

#### What we did

When the CDC announced it was conducting an <u>internal review</u> in 2022, we launched a People's Review of the CDC. We surveyed nearly 500 public health experts and community leaders and reviewed over 200 journal articles, government reports, news articles and white papers.

### What we found

We found that the CDC has prioritized individual choice and <u>short-term business interests</u> over sharing accurate scientific evidence with the public and protecting population health. The result: hundreds of thousands of preventable deaths (including over 250,000 deaths, even in 2022 when politicians and medical professionals suggested the pandemic was over) and millions disabled by Long COVID, which disproportionately impact older adults, chronically-ill and disabled people, working class and communities of color.

Instead, the agency should base public health guidance on the best scientific evidence and recommend policies that give everyone a chance to be healthy. The CDC must partner with and protect communities most impacted by the pandemic, share accurate, evidence-based information, and encourage people to protect one another using layered protections to decrease COVID-19 transmission. <a href="Emerging variants">Emerging variants</a> can already evade existing vaccines and <a href="treatments">treatments</a>. That's why a multifaceted, sustainable approach to the COVID pandemic is essential to protect people, the economy, and future generations.

### Why did we undertake this review?

In 2020, the first 100,000 deaths from COVID-19 shocked the nation. But now politicians and even some medical professionals suggest the pandemic is over, although over 250,000 people died from COVID in the US in 2022 and over 1.1 million since the pandemic began. We observed urgent warnings that the CDC was straying from its history of promoting evidence-based public health. Here are our top red flags:

- The CDC leadership downplays the serious threat COVID-19 continues to pose, likening COVID to the flu<sup>6</sup> and creating maps which deemphasize the risk of COVID transmission, in spite of the fact that COVID has been the third leading cause of death in the US since the pandemic began, 7,8 and as many as 36 million Americans have been impacted by Long COVID, 9,10 which is keeping 4 million Americans out of work. 11
- The CDC leadership has shifted recommendations following pressure from influential <u>business interests</u><sup>12</sup> and aligned public health guidance with <u>political interests</u><sup>13</sup> over scientific evidence to create an atmosphere where workers and consumers are willing to put their lives and health at risk to work and shop in unsafe conditions.
- CDC guidance pushes individual choice over a population health approach to protect everyone. 14 Life expectancy in the U. S. has fallen drastically 1,15 because the CDC has lost its focus on population health. Furthermore, this approach devalues the lives of high-risk individuals (4 in 10 US adults 16) by burdening them to protect themselves, 17 instead of encouraging everyone to protect each other.

As the People's CDC, we believe that a well-informed public would agree that we shouldn't tolerate hundreds of thousands of preventable deaths each year from COVID-19 nor the continuation of a largely preventable mass disabling event. The CDC and elected leaders often reference the need to "meet people where they are," and use this as a reason to remove public health protections, but repeated polls show that the U.S. public favors COVID-19 protections when infection rates are high. And because of misleading messaging from CDC leadership and the Biden administration, most people don't know when COVID-19 transmission rates are high.

### What we found: Our Top 10 recommendations for the CDC

### 1. Treat COVID-19 like the serious threat it is.

The CDC should communicate that COVID has been the third leading cause of death in the US for the last 3 years, including 2022. Current vaccines help prevent serious illness and death. Yet, because COVID is being allowed to spread without mitigation, new and potentially worse COVID variants are constantly emerging, such as XBB and BQ subvariants,<sup>23</sup> which can evade existing vaccines and some COVID treatments.<sup>24,25</sup>

# 2. Inform the public that Long COVID is disabling millions of people<sup>10</sup> and can affect anyone, including kids.<sup>26</sup>

Even after mild infections, COVID-19 can cause Long COVID, an umbrella term used to describe a constellation of conditions such as blood clots, heart attacks, strokes, brain fog and many others that can cause serious acute and long term syndromes. Medical literature suggests Long Covid impacts between 10% to 70% of people following COVID infections.<sup>27</sup> The CDC should educate the public that Long COVID is an important reason to prevent COVID transmission, especially because repeated infections increase the risk developing of Long COVID,<sup>28</sup> and push for increased Long COVID research, centered on patient-identified priorities.

### 3. Emphasize that COVID is airborne.

The CDC should better educate the public that COVID-19 is airborne, meaning it can spread and stay in the air much like smoke when infected people exhale, talk, sneeze or cough, especially in poorly ventilated, indoor settings.<sup>29,30</sup>

# 4. Promote a comprehensive pandemic plan, using <u>layers</u> of <u>protection</u> to decrease COVID transmission.

The CDC should recommend a comprehensive pandemic plan based on scientific evidence, which supports the combined use of masks, ventilation, testing, and vaccines together to filter the virus out of the air and decrease COVID transmission.<sup>31</sup> The CDC should implement early warning systems to prevent surges by using local community transmission (corrected for low rates of testing) and wastewater data to trigger mask mandates and other mitigation measures, instead of the Community Levels map, which emphasizes hospital capacity rather than sickness and Long COVID.

# 5. Teach people that protecting each other is the most effective and ethical approach to end the pandemic.

<u>Universal masking</u> is much more effective than individual masking to prevent COVID transmission, and some people can't wear masks.<sup>32,33</sup> The CDC should promote a community-care approach, encouraging everyone to protect each other, and recommend <u>universal mask wearing</u> when COVID rates are high, which is <u>effective</u> at reducing COVID transmission.<sup>33–36</sup>

# 6. Partner with impacted communities to plan pandemic responses.

An equitable pandemic approach should partner with impacted communities to sustainably address health inequities, and increase access to public health protections, such as high-quality masks and respirators, ventilation, and sick pay. Communities that have been most impacted by the pandemic include COVID-bereaved people; people with Long COVID; immunocompromised, chronically ill and disabled people; in-person workers, including health care workers; people who live in congregate facilities or who are incarcerated; older adults; and structurally marginalized and minoritized communities, including low-income communities, immigrants, and Black, Indigenous, and People of Color (BIPOC).<sup>37–45</sup>

### 7. CDC policies should protect the rights of all people to meet their basic needs without risking COVID infection.

When a masked person is surrounded by unmasked people in poorly ventilated spaces, even the best masks can't guarantee 100% protection. N95 respirators are highly effective, but they are expensive and not available for children, and people can't wear masks all the time. The CDC should advocate for increased access to free masks & N95 respirators, and increased access to layered protections, such as improved ventilation, free PCR and rapid tests, and universal mask requirements in public spaces and essential settings, including classrooms, workspaces, public transit, and healthcare settings, as well as accessible in-person and remote options for work and school.

### 8. Base recommendations on the best available science.

The CDC should base public health guidance on scientific evidence and minimize potential corporate and political conflict of interest in policy development and implementation.

# 9. Gather and use the best data in order to make the best policy.

The CDC should push for investments in improved wastewater data collection, using it in combination with transmission data to offer more accurate assessments of COVID-19 transmission. Only 4% to 5% of COVID infections are reported, 46 because fewer people are testing and rapid tests are not reported, whereas wastewater data can detect SARS-CoV-2 shed by people with and without symptoms, and can serve as an early warning. The CDC should further invest in improved genetic sequencing technologies to track new variants of concern and push for better data sharing and collection of race, ethnicity, occupational, and disability and sexual-orientation and gender identity (SOGI) data in order to understand the impact of COVID-19 in different populations.

# 10. Build a sustainable public health and social safety net to respond to COVID-19 and future pandemics.

Ending the state of emergency without a plan to make the vital public health measures it provided permanent, will only worsen the inequities, which have marked the COVID-19 pandemic in the United States. Instead, the CDC should publicly advocate for the COVID-19 Public Health Emergency measures which expanded access to health insurance, food stamps, paid leave, improved ventilation, and COVID vaccines, testing and treatment, among others to be made permanent and expanded upon in order to address inequities and build a resilient public health infrastructure for this and future pandemics.

# REFERENCES

- 1. Schöley J, Aburto JM, Kashnitsky I, et al. Life expectancy changes since COVID-19. Nat Hum Behav. 2022;6(12):1649-1659. doi:10.1038/s41562-022-01450-3
- 2. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. COVID Data Tracker. Published March 28, 2020. Accessed December 31, 2022. https://covid.cdc.gov/covid-data-tracker
- Linnane C. Biden to end U.S. COVID emergencies on May 11, but more than 500 people are still dying every day. MarketWatch. https://www.marketwatch.com/story/biden-to-end-u-s-covid-emergencies-on-may-11-but-more-than-500-people-are-still-dying-every-day-11675179934. Published February 1, 2023. Accessed March 7, 2023.
- 4. Arias E, Tejada-Vera B, Kochanek KD, Ahmad FB. Provisional Life Expectancy Estimates for 2021. National Center for Health Statistics (U.S.), ed. 2022;(23). a
- US COVID-19 cases and deaths by state. USAFacts. Published January 22, 2020. Accessed September 26, 2022. https://usafacts.org/visualizations/coronavirus-covid-19-spread-map
- Edwards, Erika, Snow K, Dunn L. Covid will "probably" become a seasonal virus, like the flu, CDC director says. NBC News. https://www.nbcnews.com/health/healthnews/walensky-covid-will-probably-seasonal-virus-flu-rcna19023. Published March 7, 2022. Accessed December 19, 2022.
- COVID-19 was third leading cause of death in the United States in both 2020 and 2021. National Institutes of Health (NIH). Published July 5, 2022. Accessed October 13, 2022. https://www.nih.gov/news-events/news-releases/covid-19-was-third-leading-cause-death-united-states-both-2020-2021
- Ortaliza J, Krutika Amin, Cynthia Cox. COVID-19 leading cause of death ranking. Peterson-KFF Health System Tracker. Published November 10, 2022. Accessed November 25, 2022. https://www.healthsystemtracker.org/brief/covid-19-leading-cause-of-death-ranking/
- Kimball S. Long Covid is affecting women more than men, national survey finds. CNBC. Published October 31, 2022. Accessed March 7, 2023. https://www.cnbc.com/2022/10/31/long-covid-is-affecting-women-more-than-men-federal-survey-finds.html
- Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. Long COVID Household Pulse Survey. Published February 21, 2023. Accessed March 6, 2023. https://www.cdc.gov/nchs/covid19/pulse/long-covid.htm
- 11. Bach K. New Data Shows Long Covid is Keeping as Many as 4 Million People Out of Work. Brookings. Published August 24, 2022. Accessed October 13, 2022. https://

- www.brookings.edu/research/new-data-shows-long-covid-is-keeping-as-many-as-4-million-people-out-of-work/
- Liles J. Did Delta's CEO Influence the CDC on 5-Day COVID Isolation? Snopes.com. https://www.snopes.com/news/2021/12/28/delta-ceo-cdc/. Published December 28, 2021. Accessed September 21, 2022.
- 13. Bresnahan J, Palmer A, Sherman J. Biden's polling firm: Declare a win over Covid and move on. Punchbowl News. https://punchbowl.news/archive/punchbowl-news-am-2-25-22/. Published February 25, 2022. Accessed September 8, 2022.
- Massetti GM, Jackson BR, Brooks JT, et al. Summary of Guidance for Minimizing the Impact of COVID-19 on Individual Persons, Communities, and Health Care Systems — United States, August 2022. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep. 2022;71. doi:10.15585/mmwr.mm7133e1
- 15. Masters RK, Aron LY, Woolf SH. Changes in Life Expectancy Between 2019 and 2021 in the United States and 21 Peer Countries. Published online June 1, 2022:2022.04.05.22273393. doi:10.1101/2022.04.05.22273393
- 16. Koma W, Neuman T, Claxton G, Rae M, Kates J, Michaud J. How Many Adults Are at Risk of Serious Illness If Infected with Coronavirus? Updated Data. KFF. Published April 23, 2020. Accessed July 13, 2022. https://www.kff.org/coronavirus-covid-19/issue-brief/how-many-adults-are-at-risk-of-serious-illness-if-infected-with-coronavirus/
- Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. Use and Care of Masks. Published February 11, 2020. Accessed September 24, 2022. https://www.cdc.gov/ coronavirus/2019-ncov/prevent-getting-sick/about-face-coverings.html
- Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. Digital Media Toolkit: Meet People Where They Are. Published October 14, 2022. Accessed November 16, 2022. https://www.cdc.gov/prepyourhealth/toolkits/wheretheyare.htm
- Ipsos. Topline and Methodology Axios/Ipsos Poll Wave 68. Ipsos; 2022.
   Accessed August 9, 2022. https://www.ipsos.com/sites/default/files/ct/news/documents/2022-07/Topline%20Axios%20Ipsos%20W68%20FINAL.pdf
- 20. Talev M. Axios-Ipsos poll: Americans ditch COVID masks, gain confidence. Axios. Published March 15, 2022. Accessed October 10, 2022. https://www.axios.com/2022/03/15/axios-ipsos-poll-covid-masks-spirits-rise
- @mattbc. New Poll: Voters support requiring everyone to mask in indoor public spaces in order to combat another #COVID surge https://t.co/1baYgqXvHk. Twitter. Published December 19, 2022. Accessed December 19, 2022. https://twitter.com/mattbc/status/1604954432944365569
- Czeisler MÉ, Lane RI, Orellana RC, et al. Perception of Local COVID-19 Transmission and Use of Preventive Behaviors Among Adults with Recent SARS-CoV-2 Infection

   Illinois and Michigan, June 1–July 31, 2022. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep. 2022;71(46):1471-1478. doi:10.15585/mmwr.mm7146a2
- 23. Wang Q, Iketani S, Li Z, et al. Alarming antibody evasion properties of rising SARS-CoV-2 BQ and XBB subvariants. Cell. 2022;0(0). doi:10.1016/j.cell.2022.12.018

- 24. Center for Drug Evaluation and Research. FDA Announces Bebtelovimab Is Not Currently Authorized in Any US Region. Federal Drug Administration; 2022. Accessed January 16, 2023. https://www.fda.gov/drugs/drug-safety-and-availability/fda-announces-bebtelovimab-not-currently-authorized-any-us-region
- 25. Center for Drug Evaluation and Research. FDA announces Evusheld is not currently authorized for emergency use in the U.S. FDA. Published online January 25, 2023. Accessed January 29, 2023. https://www.fda.gov/drugs/drug-safety-and-availability/fda-announces-evusheld-not-currently-authorized-emergency-use-us
- Kompaniyets L, Bull-Otterson L, Boehmer TK, et al. Post–COVID-19 Symptoms and Conditions Among Children and Adolescents — United States, March 1, 2020–January 31, 2022. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep. 2022;71(31):993-999. doi:10.15585/mmwr. mm7131a3
- 27. Davis HE, McCorkell L, Vogel JM, Topol EJ. Long COVID: major findings, mechanisms and recommendations. Nat Rev Microbiol. Published online January 13, 2023. doi:10.1038/s41579-022-00846-2
- 28. Bowe B, Xie Y, Al-Aly Z. Acute and postacute sequelae associated with SARS-CoV-2 reinfection. Nat Med. 2022;28(11):2398-2405. doi:10.1038/s41591-022-02051-3
- Brosseau LM, Ulrich A, Escandón K, Anderson C, Osterholm MT. COMMENTARY: What can masks do? Part 1: The science behind COVID-19 protection. CIDRAP. Published October 14, 2021. Accessed July 13, 2022. https://www.cidrap.umn.edu/news-perspective/2021/10/commentary-what-can-masks-do-part-1-science-behind-covid-19-protection
- World Health Organization. Coronavirus disease (COVID-19): How is it transmitted?
   Published December 23, 2021. Accessed August 7, 2022. https://www.who.int/news-room/questions-and-answers/item/coronavirus-disease-covid-19-how-is-it-transmitted
- 31. Wiens KE, Smith CP, Badillo-Goicoechea E, et al. In-person schooling and associated COVID-19 risk in the United States over spring semester 2021. Sci Adv. 2022;8(16):eabm9128. doi:10.1126/sciadv.abm9128
- 32. Howard J, Huang A, Li Z, et al. An evidence review of face masks against COVID-19. Proc Natl Acad Sci. 2021;118(4):e2014564118. doi:10.1073/pnas.2014564118
- Donovan CV, Rose C, Lewis KN, et al. SARS-CoV-2 Incidence in K–12 School Districts with Mask-Required Versus Mask-Optional Policies — Arkansas, August— October 2021. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep. 2022;71(10):384-389. doi:10.15585/ mmwr.mm7110e1
- 34. Andrejko KL, Pry JM, Myers JF, et al. Effectiveness of Face Mask or Respirator Use in Indoor Public Settings for Prevention of SARS-CoV-2 Infection California, February–December 2021. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep. 2022;71(6):212-216. doi:10.15585/mmwr.mm7106e1
- Gettings J, Czarnik M, Morris E, et al. Mask Use and Ventilation Improvements to Reduce COVID-19 Incidence in Elementary Schools — Georgia, November 16-December 11, 2020. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep. 2021;70(21):779-784.

- doi:10.15585/mmwr.mm7021e1
- 36. Kao SYZ, Sharpe JD, Lane RI, et al. Duration of Behavioral Policy Interventions and Incidence of COVID-19 by Social Vulnerability of US Counties, April–December 2020. Public Health Rep. Published online October 6, 2022:003335492211252. doi:10.1177/00333549221125202
- 37. Gawthrop E. Color of Coronavirus: COVID-19 Deaths Analyzed by Race and Ethnicity in the U.S. APM Research Lab; 2023. Accessed April 25, 2022. https://www.apmresearchlab.org/covid/deaths-by-race
- 38. Oladele CR, McKinney TL, Tolliver D, Tuckson R, Dawes D, Nunez-Smith M. The State Of Black America And COVID-19: A Two Year Assessment. The Black Coalition Against Covid; 2022. Accessed May 3, 2022. https://blackcoalitionagainstcovid.org/the-state-of-black-america-and-covid-19/
- 39. Toblin RL, Hagan LM. COVID-19 Case and Mortality Rates in the Federal Bureau of Prisons. Am J Prev Med. 2021;61(1):120-123. doi:10.1016/j.amepre.2021.01.019
- Hawkins D, Davis L, Kriebel D. COVID-19 deaths by occupation, Massachusetts, March 1–July 31, 2020. Am J Ind Med. 2021;64(4):238-244. doi:10.1002/ajim.23227
- 41. Chidambaram P, Garfield R. Nursing Homes Experienced Steeper Increase In COVID-19 Cases and Deaths in August 2021 Than the Rest of the Country. KFF. Published October 1, 2021. Accessed May 3, 2022. https://www.kff.org/coronavirus-covid-19/issue-brief/nursing-homes-experienced-steeper-increase-in-covid-19-cases-and-deaths-in-august-2021-than-the-rest-of-the-country/
- Singson JRC, Kirley PD, Pham H, et al. Factors Associated with Severe Outcomes Among Immunocompromised Adults Hospitalized for COVID-19 — COVID-NET, 10 States, March 2020–February 2022. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep. 2022;71(27):878-884. doi:10.15585/mmwr.mm7127a3
- 43. Koma W, Artiga S, Neuman T, et al. Low-Income and Communities of Color at Higher Risk of Serious Illness if Infected with Coronavirus. KFF. Published May 7, 2020. Accessed August 1, 2022. https://www.kff.org/coronavirus-covid-19/issue-brief/low-income-and-communities-of-color-at-higher-risk-of-serious-illness-if-infected-with-coronavirus/
- 44. Gleason, Jonathan, Ross, Wendy, Fossi, Alexander, Blonsky, Heather, Tobias, Jane, Stephens, Mary. The Devastating Impact of Covid-19 on Individuals with Intellectual Disabilities in the United States. NEJM Catal Innov Care Deliv. Published online March 5, 2021. Accessed August 1, 2022. https://catalyst.nejm.org/doi/full/10.1056/CAT.21.0051
- 45. Slootjes J, Bloemraad I. COVID-19 is Blind to Legal Status, but Can Disproportionately Hurt Immigrants. U.C. Berkeley Social Science Matrix. Published April 22, 2020. Accessed August 1, 2022. https://matrix.berkeley.edu/research-article/covid-19-blind-legal-status-can-disproportionately-hurt-immigrants/
- Pettypiece S. Covid testing providers scale back despite worries of another winter surge. NBC News. https://www.nbcnews.com/politics/covid-testing-providers-scaleback-worries-another-winter-surge-rcna47777. Published September 17, 2022.

Accessed October 17, 2022.

47. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. National Wastewater Surveillance System. Published May 16, 2022. Accessed November 25, 2022. https://www.cdc.gov/healthywater/surveillance/wastewater-surveillance/wastewater-surveillance.html

